



Gila and Verde Basins February 10-13, 2005

National Verification Team Case Study March 25, 2008

Lisa Holts and Brenda Alcorn Colorado Basin River Forecast Center



Case Studies in Two Basins





- Two headwater and two downstream forecast points in each basin
- Segments calibrated and run on one hour time step
- MAPX input from MPE
- One of first events for these hourly calibrations



Event Summary



- Precipitation Begins February 10, 2005 21z
- Precipitation Ends February 13, 2005 5z
- Verde River (storm total MAPs ~2.0-3.0 in)
 - VDPA3 (H) peak: 2/13 01z 10.5 ft 8,140 cfs (flood 13.0 ft)
 - VDCA3 (L) peak: 2/12 12z 17.9 ft 27,000 cfs (flood 14.0 ft)**
 - OAKA3 (H) peak: 2/12 09z 11.0 ft 9,100 cfs (flood 14.0 ft)
 - OACA3 (L) peak: 2/12 13z 13.7 ft 12,300 cfs (flood 9.0 ft)**

• Gila River (storm total MAPs ~1.5-2.5 in)

- GILN5 (H) peak: 2/12 23z 12.3 ft 19,800 cfs (flood 11.0 ft)**
- GVRN5 (L) peak: 2/13 05z 21.4 ft 35,300 cfs (flood 15.0 ft)**
- GSFN5 (H) peak: 2/12 21z 12.6 ft 13,500 cfs (flood 15.0 ft)
- SFCA3 (L) peak: 2/12 20z 23.4 ft 18,300 cfs (flood 22.0 ft)**

** went above flood during event



WR Case Study



- Use 'ofs_spin' to create a pure model simulation time series to use as a control
 - Start from a set of fs5files from November
 2004 and run through February 2005.
 - No mods included for entire run.
 - Feed only observed precipitation, temperature and freezing levels (no forecasts).



Pure Model Flow Plots



GILA

Plot of Forecast-Observed Instantaneous Discharge Data Pairs for NONE

Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT



VERDE

Plot of Forecast-Observed Instantaneous Discharge Data Pairs for CBRFC



Flow Time Series

30

23

fs)





Date/Time (GMT)

ID ATMOSA NOAA

PARTMENT OF

Plot of Forecast and Observed Instantaneous Discharge Time Series for CBRFC Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Location: Gila – Virden, nr, Blue Ck, blo [GVRN5(QRIFZZZ)] Forecast Categories: No Categories Defined JESUANCE TIMES (clickable) 2005-02-09 16:00:00
 2005-02-10 16:00:00
 2005-02-10 21:00:00 peak 35,300 cfs 33 2005-02-11 16:00:00 - 2005-02-11 22:00:00 - 2005-02-12 03:00:00 --- 2005-02-12 07:00:00 - 2005-02-12 11:00:00 - 2005-02-12 14:00:00



Plot of Forecast and Observed Instantaneous Discharge Time Series for CBREC Time Period: 2005-02-08 12:42:30 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:42:53 GMT Lead times: 0 hours – 72 hours Location: Verde – Clarkdale [VDCA3(QRIFZZZ)] Forecast Categories: No Categories Defined





Gila Bias by Lead Time

1.0



Full Time Series

2/10 18Z – 2/15 12Z

Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location



Rising Limb 2/11 18Z – 2/13 00Z

Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location Time Period: 2005-02-11 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-13 00:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 72 hours Locations: GILN5, GSFN5, GVRN5, SFCA3







- Use 'ofs_spin' to create a raw model forecast and simulation time series to use as a control
 - Start from a set of fs5files from February 7, 2005 and run through February 18, 2005
 - No mods included from starting point on.
 - Forecasts created by feeding
 - Observed temperatures and freezing level
 - Forecast precipitation
 - Final simulation created by feeding
 - Observed temperatures and freezing level
 - Observed precipitation



MAP Scatter Plots



GILA

GILN5(L,M,U), GVRN5(L,U), GSFN5(L,M,U), SFCA3(L,M,U)

Plot of Forecast-Observed 6-Hourly Precipitation Amount Data Pairs for NONE Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-13 00:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 72 hours Selected Location: No Name Available [NONE]



• Mostly under-forecast, especially for values above ~0.15 inches

VERDE

VDPA3(L,M,U), VDCA3(L,M,U), OAKA3(L,M,U), OACA3(L,U)

Plot of Forecast-Observed 6-Hourly Precipitation Amount Data Pairs for NONE Time Period: 2005-02-08 12:42:30 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:42:53 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 72 hours Selected Location: No Name Available [NONE]



Much better spreadUnder and Over forecasting



Gila MAP Time Series







Verde MAP Time Series







MAP Stats







RMSE vs. Location



Compared by categories where Cat 1 < 0.20" Cat 2 >= 0.20"

GILA

Plot of 6-Hourly Precipitation Amount Error Statistics against Location for CBRFC Compared Over Observed Category Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-13 00:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 72 hours Locations: GILN5LLH, GILN5LMH, GILN5LUH, GSFN5LLH, GSFN5LMH, GSFN5LUH, GVRN5LLH, GVRN5LUH, SFCA3LLH, SFCA3LMH, SFCA3LUH 0.5 STATISTIC (Observed Category RMSE (<.20)</p> 0.45 0.45 RMSE (>=.20) BS_MEAN (<.20) BS_STDDEV(<.20) 0.40 0.40■ OBS_MEAN (>=.20) OBS_STDDEV(>=.20) Ĵ ^{0.35}).35 Value 1 0.30 0.30 O.25 0.25 0.20 0.25 alue 0.20 Ê E 0.19 0.150.10 0.10 0.05 0.05 0.00 00 GILN5 GSFN5 GVRN5 SFCA3 LMU U LMU L LMU

VERDE

Plot of 6-Hourly Precipitation Amount Error Statistics against Location for CBRFC Compared Over Observed Category Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-13 00:01:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 72 hours Locations: 0ACA3LLH, 0ACA3LUH, 0AKA3HLH, 0AKA3HMH, 0AKA3HUH,





Bias vs. Location



Compared by categories where Cat 1 < 0.20" Cat 2 >= 0.20"

VERDE

GILA





Lead Time Statistics



GILA

Plot of 6-Hourly Precipitation Amount Error Statistics against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-13 00:01:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 72 hours Locations: GILN5LLH, GILN5LMH, GILN5LUH, GSFN5LLH, GSFN5LMH, GSFN5LUH, GVRN5LLH, GVRN5LUH, SFCA3LLH, SFCA3LMH, SFCA3LUH 0.25 STATISTIC 🔶 RMSE 0.23 0.21 0.19 (iii) 0.17 (iii) Statistic 0.13 10 ā 0.11 0.09 0.07 0.05 24 36 42 48 54 66 72 6 12 18 30 60 Lead Time Interval (hrs)

VERDE

Plot of 6-Hourly Precipitation Amount Error Statistics against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-13 00:01:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 72 hours Locations: OACA3LLH, OACA3LUH, OAKA3HLH, OAKA3HNH, OAKA3HUH, VDCA3LLH, VDCA3LUH, VDCA3LUH, VDPA3HLH, VDPA3HMH, VDPA3HUH





Lead Time Statistics



GILA

Plot of 6-Hourly Precipitation Amount Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location

Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-13 00:01:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 72 hours Locations: GILN5LLH, GILN5LMH, GILN5LUH, GSFN5LLH, GSFN5LMH,

GSFN5LUH, GVRN5LLH, GVRN5LUH, SFCA3LLH, SFCA3LMH, SFCA3LUH



VERDE

Plot of 6-Hourly Precipitation Amount Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location

Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-13 00:01:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 72 hours

Locations: OACA3LLH, OACA3LUH, OAKA3HLH, OAKA3HMH, OAKA3HUH, VDCA3LLH, VDCA3LMH, VDCA3LUH, VDPA3HLH, VDPA3HMH, VDPA3HUH





Gila vs. Verde MAP



RMSE, MAXERR, ME by Location

Bias by Location



QPF slightly better in Verde Basin



15

13

11

Forecast Instantaneous Discharge (kcfs)

5

3

Raw Model Flow Scatter Plots



GILA

GILN5, GVRN5, **GSFN5, SFCA3**



VERDE

VDPA3, VDCA3, OAKA3, OACA3

Plot of Forecast-Observed Instantaneous Discharge Data Pairs for NONE Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT



Under-forecast

•Better spread







GILN5

Plot of Forecast and Observed Instantaneous Discharge Time Series for CBRFC Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Location: Gila - Gila, nr [GILN5(QRIFVZZ)] Forecast Categories: No Categories Defined



GVRN5

Plot of Forecast and Observed Instantaneous Discharge Time Series for CBRFC Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Location: Gila - Virden, nr, Blue Ck, blo [GVRN5(QRIFVZZ)] Forecast Categories: No Categories Defined



Upstream

Downstream



Gila Raw Model Time Series



GSFN5

Plot of Forecast and Observed Instantaneous Discharge Time Series for CBRFC Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Location: San Francisco - Glenwood, nr [GSFN5(QRIFVZZ)] Forecast Categories: No Categories Defined



SFCA3

Plot of Forecast and Observed Instantaneous Discharge Time Series for CBRFC Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Location: San Francisco - Clifton [SFCA3(QRIFVZZ)] Forecast Categories: No Categories Defined



Upstream

Downstream



Verde Raw Model Time Series

OACA3



OAKA3





Verde Raw Model Time Series



VDPA3

Plot of Forecast and Observed Instantaneous Discharge Time Series for CBRFC Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Location: Verde - Paulden, nr [VDPA3(QRIFVZZ)] Forecast Categories: No Categories Defined



VDCA3

Plot of Forecast and Observed Instantaneous Discharge Time Series for CBRFC Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Location: Verde - Clarkdale [VDCA3(QRIFVZZ)] Forecast Categories: No Categories Defined



Upstream

Downstream



RMSE/ME by Lead Time



VERDE

GILA





_{پە}مىسى NOAA

ARTMENT OF









Bias by Lead Time



GILA

Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Locations: GILN5, GSFN5, GVRN5, SFCA3 1.2 STATISTIC (Location) BIAS (GILN5) 1.1 BIAS (GSFN5) BIAS (GVRN5) 1.0 BIAS (SFCA3) ٠ 0.9 Correlation/Bias/Skill Value 0.8 0.7 0.6 0.5 0.40.3 0.2 0.1 0.0 12 24 30 36 42 48 54 60 66 72 78 84 90 96 102 108 114 120 6 18 Lead Time Interval (hrs)

VERDE

Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Locations: OACA3, OAKA3, VDCA3, VDPA3





Gila Bias by Lead Time



Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Locations: GILNS, GSFNS, GVRNS, SFCA3



Full Time Series

Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location Time Period: 2005-02-11 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-13 06:00:00 GMT

Lead times: 0 hours – 120 hours Locations: GILN5, GSFN5, GVRN5, SFCA3



Rising Limb

Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location Time Period: 2005-02-13 06:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT





Verde Bias by Lead Time



Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Locations: OACA3, OAKA3, VDCA3, VDPA3



Full Time Series

Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Leadtime Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Location Time Period: 2005-02-11 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-12 18:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Locations: OACA3, OAKA3, VDCA3, VDPA3











RMSE by Analysis Interval



GILA

Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Error Statistics against Analysis Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Leadtime Interval Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Locations: GILN5, GSFN5, GVRN5, SFCA3 15 STATISTIC (Leadtime Interval) 🔶 RMSE (0h - 24h) 7 13 6-11 Error Statistic Value (kcfs) Error Statistic Value (kcfs) 5 З 5 2 1 0 11 17:59:59 14 23:59:59 05:59:59 12 11:59:59 12 23:59:59 13 05:59:59 13 17:59:59 14 11:59:59 10 23:59:59 11 11:59:59 11 23:59:59 14 05:59:59 14 17:59:59 15 05:59:59 10 23:59:59 12 05:59:59 12 17:59:59 11:59:59 13 23:59:59 11:59:59

VERDE

Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Error Statistics against Analysis Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Leadtime Interval Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Locations: OACA3, OAKA3, VDCA3, VDPA3





Bias by Analysis Interval

2.0



GILA

Plot of Instantaneous Discharge Correlation, Bias, and/or Skill against Analysis Interval for CBRFC Compared Over Leadtime Interval Time Period: 2005-02-10 18:00:00 GMT - 2005-02-15 12:00:00 GMT Lead times: 0 hours - 120 hours Locations: GILN5, GSFN5, GVRN5, SFCA3 1.6 STATISTIC (Leadtime Interval) 🔶 BIAS (0h - 24h) 1.4 - BIAS (48h - 72h) - BIAS (72h - 96h) 1.2 Correlation/Bias/Skill Value 0.8 0.6 0.4 0.2 0.0 14 17:59:59 11:59:59 12 17:59:59 14 11:59:59 0 23:59:59 1 05:59:59 1 11:59:59 11 17:59:59 1 23:59:59 2 05:59:59 2 11:59:59 2 23:59:59 3 05:59:59 3 11:59:59 3 17:59:59 3 23:59:59 4 05:59:59 4 23:59:59 5 05:59:59

VERDE





Error Statistics

VERDE



GILA





Gila Flow Comparison

RI	VER FO
SIL	AR
	A.A.A.
SCB	RFC
"OTO	NUTER C





SFCA3



GVRN5



Verde Flow Comparison

2.093

-0.890

2005/02/10

17:51:18

2005/02/11

17:51:18

2005/02/12

17:51-18

Date/Time (GMT)

2005/02/13

17:51:18

2005/02/14

17:51:18

SIN R	IVER FOR	
BA		
SCI	BRFC	
1070	O HELAS	







No Radar Coverage



GILA



VERDE







- In the Gila Basin QPF was too low and so were flow forecasts.
- In the Verde Basin QPF was also a bit low, but flow forecasts were too high.
- Better QPF in the Verde Basin than in the Gila Basin did not translate into better flow forecasts.
- Incorrect QPF does not fully explain poor flow forecasts in either basin.
 - Was the observed precipitation (MPE issues) correct?
 - Were the model states (especially soil moisture) correct?







- MAPs appeared to have an effect on the simulation
- Initial conditions also played a roll in simulation
- Helpful to separate periods to see effects